

A summary of the eleventh meeting of the ODF Forest Carbon Stakeholders Working Group - Monday June 2, 2008 in Portland, OR.

Present: Jay Morey – ODF, Jim Cathcart – ODF, Mike Schnee – Michael Schnee Consulting (Facilitator / Mediator), Mike Cloughesy – OFRI, Linc Cannon – OFIC, Adrian Miller – WFPA, Steve Brink – CFA, Chuck Burley – AFRC, Mike Gaudern – OSWA, Scott Zimmerman – Oregon Woodland Cooperative, Brian Kernohan – Forest Capital Partners, Keith Balter – Forest Capital Partners, Jake Gibbs – Lone Rock Timber Company, Eric Schooler – The Collins Company, Evan Smith – The Conservation Fund, Bettina Von Hagen – Ecotrust, George Schunk – Ecotrust, Sara Vickerman – Defenders of Wildlife and Bob Deal – USFS PNW Research

Via Conference Call: Steve Bernath – WA Dept. of Ecology and Kevin Raymond – Pacific Forest Trust

WCI / Policy Updates:

- A WCI stakeholder workshop was held on May 21st in Salt Lake City, UT. Several group members attended and held a reception to interface with WCI Staff on forestry offsets. The reception went well with approximately 45 people in attendance and helped raise awareness of forestry as a viable offset. Feedback from group members in attendance felt the product the WCI releases in August will most likely be high level describing a cap and trade framework, however, lacking an abundance of specific details. Much of the discussion is currently around allocations and transportation with some work being done on electricity as well. The feeling among the group members who attended the Salt Lake City meeting said they predict the dialogue with the WCI will most likely be a longer term process extending past August 2008.
- A future WCI workshop is scheduled for July 29th in San Diego, CA.
- In Oregon, a meeting on May 29th with the House Energy and Environment committee went well. Linc Cannon (OFIC) and John Audley (TNC) attended and spoke about the work group and some of the issues we have been working through. Linc provided written testimony as well.
- On May 30th, several group members attended a meeting with Congresswoman Darlene Hooley, specifically speaking to the importance of forests in federal policy related to climate change. Congresswoman Hooley is a member of the House Energy & Commerce Subcommittee on Energy and Air Quality.

Discussion on the pathway the group should take for subsequent meetings:

The group discussed the options for moving forward following the lengthy discussions on baseline/ additionality and the letter sent to the WCI on May 19. Options considered included: Option 1) - working through additional principles such as permanence, leakage etc., Option 2) - working through a couple examples of project types, Option 3) - a hybrid approach of Option 1 and Option 2, and Option 4) - continuing discussion on baseline to develop more detail. The group acknowledged our discussion around baseline has so far been to educate ourselves and then weigh pluses and minuses of various approaches. *The group was in general agreement that while we have reached agreement on the desired outcomes and the matrix assessments, we have not reached total consensus on baseline and it remains an unfinished topic for future discussion.* However, numerous group members felt we should work through the other principles such as permanence, leakage, etc., otherwise we might not get past baseline in our remaining scheduled meetings. Several members felt there was value in working to a certain level of agreement and detail on all the individual principles and then pulling them together and revisiting each component again as time allows. The general feeling was talking about projects prior to having some agreement on the principles was a bit premature. In addition, the group convened in Washington is tackling project types so therefore there may be some opportunity for the two groups to share recommendations without walking over the same ground twice. After weighing the options, the group concluded to shelve baseline for now and to take on permanence, leakage, etc.

Discussion on Permanence:

Jim Cathcart led the discussion, beginning with some education and a standard definition of permanence.

Jim then laid out a six step process for working through the issue of permanence.

- (1) Definition/ Education
- (2) Desired Outcomes/ Functions
- (3) Evaluation (Known & Emerging Approaches)
- (4) Consensus/ Range of Views
- (5) Synthesis Discussion
- (6) Protocol/ Recommendation

Jim suggested we include several of the Desired Outcomes developed for baseline. In addition, some additional desired outcomes discussed include:

- Economically Valid
- Ecologically Valid
- It is okay to have a renting scheme as long as there is a landlord
- "Long Enough" is.....?
- Permanence leads to retirement of a ton of carbon

Jim Cathcart will develop a matrix for developing the desired outcomes and approaches on permanence for discussion next meeting. This matrix process will be similar to the one we went through to analyze approaches on baseline. Mike Schnee will be sending out an e-mail soliciting additional items to be included in the "desired outcomes" for permanence.

Next Steps/ Next Meeting:

- Discussion will continue on permanence next meeting, developing desired outcomes and weighing pros and cons for various approaches to permanence.

When: Monday June 23, 2008 from **1:00 pm to 4:00 pm** (*Note – there will be no speaker / presentation at this meeting*)

Where: Portland - Board Room (Third Floor) at the US Bank Building located at 625 SW Stark Street, Portland, OR 97205. [See the Google link below for maps and directions.](#)

<http://maps.google.com/maps?f=q&hl=en&geocode=&time=&date=&ttype=&q=625+sw+stark+st,+portland&sll=37.0625,-95.677068&sspn=31.646818,59.238281&ie=UTF8&ll=45.522691,-122.677739&spn=0.006825,0.014462&z=16&om=0>

Future Meetings Scheduled:

When: Mondays July 7, and July 21 from 12:00 pm or 1:00 pm to 4:00 pm with a brown bag educational presentations? (Topics and speakers TBD) from 12:00 pm to 1:00 pm

Where: Portland – DEQ Building (Commission Room) at 811 SW Sixth Ave Portland, OR 97204. (*July 21st meeting*)

Where: Portland - Board Room (Third Floor) at the US Bank Building located at 625 SW Stark Street, Portland, OR 97205. (*July 7th meeting*)

Jay C. Morey

Forester - Astoria District - Sunset Unit

*Chair - Astoria District Safety and Wellness
Office - (503) 325-5451 ext. 306*